



**A Brief Analysis of Coastal Policies and Practices for the Project  
(EU funded):**

**Tackling Poverty in Pakistan's Coastal Communities through the  
Sustainable Coastal Livelihood Project**

Jan. 12th – Feb. 27th and March 29th- April 12th 2004



Report by: Saira Moinuddin, Research Intern

(Internship with WWF Pakistan from October 2003 – June 2004)

---

*World Wide Fund for Nature-Pakistan*

*Karachi Regional Office*

*606-607, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Fortune Centre, P.E.C.H.S., Block-6, Shahra-e- Faisal, Karachi-75400*

*Ph: 0092-21-4544791/92*

*Fax: 0092-21-4544790*

*Email: [wwfkhi@khi.compol.com](mailto:wwfkhi@khi.compol.com)*

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	3
1. Introduction of the Tackling Poverty in Pakistan's Coastal Communities Project	4
2. Objectives of the Study	5
3. Methodology	5
3.1 Research	
a) Primary Research	5
b) Secondary Research	5
3.3 Tabular Analysis	5
4. Key Findings	
4.1 Relevant Laws, Policies, Agreements Impacting Fisheries and Fisherfolk Communities	6
4.2 Federal Policy	7
4.3 Provincial Policy Sindh	7
4.4 Provincial Policy Balochistan	8
4.5 Stakeholder Meetings/Workshops/Seminars	8
5. Future Directions	9
6. Conclusion	10
7. Recommendation	11
8. References	11
 <u>Annexes:</u>	
Annex - I      Institution Analysis Table	12 - 15
Annex – II     Policy-Impact Analysis Table	15 - 18
Annex - III    Stakeholder Meetings, Workshops and Seminars	18
Annex - IV     Fishermen Cooperative Society Data and Questionnaire	18 - 20
Annex - V      Minutes of the Meeting of Fishermen Cooperative Society	20 - 21
Annex - VI     Minutes of the Meeting of Marine Fisheries Department and Shirkat Gah	21

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to thank WWF Pakistan Karachi Regional Office for all their kind help and support. The below listed individuals have made it possible for me to experience a maximum learning experience and to enhance my skills:

- Dr. Ejaz Ahmad
- Naseer Memon
- Faisal Farooq Khan
- Syed Ali Hasnain
- Rahat Jabeen
- Akram Farooqui
- Salvador Fernandes
- Khurram Shams Khan
- Shameer Ali Prasla
- Rizwan Asghar
- Hote Khan Jamali
- Tahir Mahboob Ali
- Fayyaz Rasool Sindhu
- Babar Hussain
- Abdul Moeed Khan
- Jehangir Durrani
- Saveeta Khiani
- Ejaz Iqbal
- Laiq Shah
- Mohammad Sami
- Zaffar
- Asmatullah
- Naseeb Gul
- Ahmad Ali

Their constant dedication to their work will be kept in my best memory.

My gratitude also goes to Shirkat Gah, especially Zubeida Birwani for her generous support in providing material on the fishing communities of Sindh and Baluchistan.

## 1. Introduction of Tackling Poverty in Pakistan's Coastal Communities

WWF has been active in conservation of natural resources and environmental awareness activities in over 96 countries. One of these countries is Pakistan with the head office of WWF-P in Lahore. Regional offices are in Gilgit, Quetta, Peshawar, Muzaffarabad, Islamabad, Karachi and project offices are in Chitral, Zhob, Nathiagali, Chakwal, Sonmiani, Imit and Aliabad. It's mission is to conserve ecosystems, protect species and all types of biodiversity by promoting actions to reduce pollution and to enhance the capacity of local communities in social, environmental and economic issues.

In February 2003, the European Union approved funding for a 4-year project titled *Tackling Poverty in Pakistan's Coastal Communities* aiming to achieve sustainable natural resource use and improved livelihood for four coastal communities of Sindh and Balochistan. The project entails a broad range of outputs encompassing community mobilization & development, sustainable fisheries management, sustainable forestry management, and policy advocacy. This report attempts to identify key legislative, policy and practices that are detrimental to coastal community livelihoods by analyzing linkages between existing policies and their impact on the livelihoods of targeted coastal communities. The undertaken study was supported by meetings with various stakeholders, incl. Shirkat Gah, Marine Fisheries Department and the Fishermen Cooperative Society.

A workshop was conducted by WWF Karachi office in order to explore the interaction between poverty in the coastal areas and natural resource use. The workshop provided a platform for discussions of coastal resource policies and practices in Sindh and Balochistan through interaction of stakeholders from federal and provincial line departments and a variety of civil society organizations.



## **2. Objectives of the study**

Overall objective of the study was to analyze key coastal resource policies and practices and suggest recommendations for their improvement in the future.

The specific objectives of the study that supported the overall objective were set as follows:

- Identification of the key federal and provincial policies and practices for the conservation of the coastal ecosystem
- Brief analysis of the policies and practices and recommendations based on the analysis

## **3. Methodology**

### ***3.1 Research***

#### ***a) Primary Research***

Primary data was collected through stakeholder meetings, i.e. Shirkat Gah, Marine Fisheries Department, Fishermen Cooperative Society, and Semi Structured Interviews (SSI) (see annex) in order to observe the present situation of policy implementation in Sindh and Balochistan. CBOs and WWF-P executives were interviewed through SSI schedule.

#### ***b) Secondary Research***

Secondary data was collected by consulting various reports and studies available at WWF-P's Karachi regional office

### ***3.2 Tabular Analysis***

Through designing tables the collected data was analyzed. First, by identifying key legislations and policies that are already in place for the coastal resources. Secondly, by distinguishing between federal and provincial policies and legislation. Both the primary research and the secondary research explained above supported the tabular analysis.





#### 4. Key Findings

##### *4.1 Relevant Laws, Policies & Agreements Impacting Coastal Fisheries and Fisherfolk Communities*

In order to identify relevant policies which have shaped the lives of the Pakistani fisherfolk along the coastal lines of Sindh and Balochistan one has to visualize all the past relevant policies and legislation which have had an impact on the current situation. It is essential to differentiate between federal and provincial policies. Provincial policies, such as the Sindh Fisheries Ordinance of 1980 have less impact on the reality, they are often dominated by federal policies and legislations such as the Deep Sea Fishing Policy of 1995. Laws to protect certain fish species are not being implemented because the Deep Sea Fishing Policy allows trawlers to harvest the sea without any discrimination for species with diminishing populations. Deep Sea trawlers are also active during the breeding season of fish in the months of June and July which does not help in recovering the exhausted fish species.

##### *Relevant Laws, Policies & Agreements*

<b>Federal</b>	<b>Sindh</b>	<b>Balochistan</b>
The West Pakistan Fisheries Ordinance, 1961	Sindh Fisheries Ordinance, 1980	Balochistan Sea Fisheries Ordinance, 1971
The Karachi Port Trust Ordinance, 1994	Karachi Fisheries Harbor Authority Ordinance, 1984	Balochistan Sea Fisheries Act, 1986 (Amendment to Fisheries Ordinance 1971)
The Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997	Coastal Development Authority Act of Sindh, 1994	Balochistan Sea-Fisheries Amendment (to 1971 Ordinance) Ordinance, 1992
Deep Sea Fishing Policy, 1995 (Amended in 2001)	Notification, 5th Dec. 1995 (ban on harmful nets by Govt. of Sindh)	Balochistan Sea Fisheries Act, 1994 (Amendment to Fisheries Ordinance 1971)
Territorial Waters and		

Maritime Zones Act, 1976		
Exclusive Fishery Zone Act (Regulation of Fishing), 1975 (Amended in 1983)		
Korangi Fisheries Harbor Authority Ordinance, 1982		
The Indus Water Treaty, 1960		
The Indus Water Accord , 1991		

#### 4.2 Federal Policy

Deep Sea Fishing Policy, 1995, 2001	Comment on Impact
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Amended in 2001, allowing foreign trawlers to come within 12 nm</li> <li>Improve foreign exchange earnings through increased export of fish and fishery products</li> <li>Socio-economic uplift of the small-scale fishermen</li> <li>Division into 3 <u>Fishing Zones</u>:</li> </ul> <p>Zone-I: 0-12 nm, Small-Scale Fishing, fishing rights reserved for traditional fishermen of Sindh and Balochistan</p> <p>Zone-II: 12-35 nm, reserved medium-sized trawlers</p> <p>Zone-III: 35-200 nm, Industrial Fishing</p> <p>Foreign vessels have been fishing in the EEZ with the collaboration of Pakistani firms</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Foreign trawlers are bound to off-load their catch in Pakistan</li> <li>Extention of the restricted zone outwards to deep sea vessels of all sizes, whether Pakistani or foreign</li> <li>Discard is thrown in to the sea, creating environmental pollution in the coastal waters and genocide of the juvenile fish species</li> <li>Violations of fishing boundaries by deep sea fishing trawlers</li> <li>Trawlers off-load their catch in Dubai, Abu Dhabi and Oman</li> </ul>

#### 4.3 Provincial Legislation Sindh

Sindh Fisheries Ordinance, 1980	Comments on Impact
<p>Provides regulation by leases, licenses and permits</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Specific nets: Boola, Gujjo and Katra prohibited to protect breeding of juvenile fish</li> <li>Seasonal bans, e.g. shrimp trawling banned during the summer months (June, July)</li> <li>Fish Species can be declared “protected”, e.g. ban on catching Rohu, Mori, Thaila, Calbasu</li> <li>Penalties including seizure of catch, gear and craft can be imposed for violations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Marine pollution can be controlled through enforcement of the Ordinance</li> <li>Necessary amendments to cover agricultural effluent</li> <li>Rise on monetary penalties in order to have any impact on violations</li> <li>Ordinance contains no provisions for damage compensation to fisherfolk</li> <li>Seasonal ban should be applied to all commercial fishing craft without exceptions</li> <li>Enforcing bans on catch and</li> </ul>

	on seasons will require restrictions on harbour landings and processing units
--	---

#### ***4.4 Provincial Legislation Balochistan***

<b>Balochistan Sea Fisheries Ordinance, 1971</b>	<b>Comments on Impact</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Fishing within three miles off the coast banned to all except small local craft</li> <li>▪ Prohibition against destructive nets</li> <li>▪ Size restrictions on catching shrimp and lobsters</li> <li>▪ Penalties for infringement of any of the rules such as fines, imprisonment and keeping violaters and their equipment with the Tehsildar/Assistant Commissioner until a date of prosecution</li> <li>▪ Illegal fish catch is auctioned and proceeds will either be deposited under the Head of the Fisheries Dept. or returned to the poacher depending on outcome of legal proceedings</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ No provisions to deal with pollution, must be rectified to deal with increasing urbanization, agriculture and proposed expansions of ports</li> <li>▪ Marine resources have been better protected than in Sindh</li> <li>▪ Commercial vessels from Sindh frequently violate the restriction through collusion with Balochistan agencies</li> <li>▪ Balochistan should control overfishing in its waters through a comprehensive licensing system (actions against corruption)</li> </ul>

#### ***4.5 Stakeholder Meetings/Workshops/Seminars***

Various stakeholders helped develop a clearer vision about the ground reality of fishermen communities along the coast of Sindh and Baluchistan. In field observations one tends to lose objectivity and take sides for the poor, yet later it is crucial to keep an unbiased orientation in mind in order to conclude the analysis. Stakeholders like Shirkat Gah primarily focused on the rights of fishermen and demanded the prohibition of the Deep Sea Fishing Policy without keeping the importance of economy in mind. Without a stable economy Pakistan will never be able to tackle the poverty issue. The development of the marine economy is of high importance for future stabilization, yet keeping in mind that the profit should be equally distributed amongst the communities as well as industries with its numerous employees.

Speaking with representatives of the Fishermen Cooperative Society one could make out that communication between various government departments and civil society organizations was limited. Laws, policies and practices are passed out without specific indications why they are essential. It is hard to tell what is presently going on in the development of the fisheries sector. Material is hard to accumulate, most governing bodies do not want to give any information out. Clearly, this situation has to change if Pakistan wants to achieve some change and development. Only open access to research material will enable people to develop further research and bring about change.



The Marine Fisheries Department emphasized on the lack of proper implementation of policies, laws and practices in Sindh and Balochistan. During the summer months, June and July, the breeding season of fish, small scale fishermen harvest the coastal waters, especially coastal creeks which are under protection, and destroy juvenile fish hatcheries. The illegal fishing has severe consequences and results in the depletion of fish species. Improper cooling devices force the fishermen to sell the second class catch as poultry food. Selling the catch as poultry food gives the fishermen a very low income and is in the long term not enough to support their families.

The two day seminar on “Environmental, Social and Cultural Impact of Water Scarcity in Sindh” (16<sup>th</sup> January, 2004) at the University of Sindh in Jamshoro displayed how individuals have been thinking through finding solutions to the water crisis. The water crisis directly affects fishing communities and forces them, when facing insufficient water access, to migrate to densely populated cities. Mega cities like Karachi usually have scarce job opportunities for unskilled fishermen from the coast and they end up in more severe poverty.

## **5. Future Directions**

In order to direct our actions for the future we have to ask ourselves questions which will eventually lead into the betterment of the overall scenario. The following questions must be asked:

- How do we implement policies in Pakistan?
- How do we fight against corruption?
- How do we promote cooperation between fishermen communities, the Government of Pakistan and various stakeholders?

Policies can only be implemented successfully if the government does not suffer under corruption. Until the overall spread disease of “corruption” is not removed from governing bodies there is little hope for proper implementation of policies. The question arises why corruption is such a common phenomena in Pakistan. Perhaps one of the reasons could be the inadequate payments to government employees. Government employees as well as police forces find their payment often too insufficient to feed their families. Every day living costs force them to go beyond human ethics and to bribe the ordinary Pakistani citizens. This phenomena triggers off a chain reaction, which enables the ordinary citizen to commit illegal actions if he bribes a police force or government official for it.

In order to achieve cooperation between fishermen communities, the Government of Pakistan and other stakeholders, the Government has to initiate roundtable conferences which give fisherfolk a voice. Compromises have to be made in order to represent the role of a social-welfare state which is essential for Pakistan to become in the future.



## 6. Conclusion

Small scale fishermen have not been successful due to the lack of navigational aids, fish finding equipment, training and skills in modern fishing technology. Furthermore, post harvest losses occur due to lack of refrigeration and exploitative marketing system including poaching by industrial fishing vessels in their domain cause further suffering for the fishermen communities along the coastal lines of Sindh and Baluchistan. And on top of all this hardship, the Government of Pakistan prohibits the fishing in certain seasons and hinders the fishermen from earning an income for their families. Based on this research it is an evident truth that policies are being developed without actually knowing the field situation and the ground reality impact on the people which are directly affected by laws, policies and practices. Unless proper research is being conducted before releasing new legislation the hardship of the people will remain. The workshop has shown how important it is to have roundtable stakeholder meetings to exchange views and to keep the communication flowing.

Taking into account the tabular analysis one can identify the following root problem for the coastal misery:

1. Unsuccessful Implementation of Policies
2. No Investment into the Social Sector:
  - a. Education, Health, Communication
  - b. Stagnant Poverty

Overall it can be said that these root problems would not exist if an environmental ethic would have been present in the mind set of the people. This environmental ethic would incorporate the responsibility for the environment and all actions by humans while interacting with the environment.

Traditional fishermen of Sindh and Baluchistan have preserved their environmental ethic for centuries. Their affection for their fishing grounds made them practice sustainable fishing practices. The existing environmental ethic was disrupted when migratory people from other parts of Pakistan or even other countries arrived in the region. Their previous loss of home made them not focus on the environment rather than the profit making. So, eventually, the environmental ethic of sustainable fishing practices was lost over time for the majority of the people.

By prioritizing education as an investment sector, the country of Pakistan can achieve change. Education starts with building schools and sending both girls and boys to school. Children should not be forced to leave school because of earning a living for their families. In such situation the

state must act as a social-welfare state instead of investing billions of lakhs into the defence sector. In school, an environmental ethic should be enforced and this starts with introducing environmental education in schools which has long been a subject covered by dust.

## **7. Recommendations**

Effective change regarding the situation of fishermen living in poverty can only be achieved by the following points:

1. Education
  - a. Community Awareness Programmes
  - b. Training, e.g. Developing an environmental ethic and improving technical skills
2. Advocacy
  - a. Objective, unbiased research

To implement the ideas of environmental education in schools and other institutions the community has to be well aware of a target driven programme. This can be visualized by holding community awareness programmes, whereby the community should be asked to interact in fully participating numbers.

Once having introduced a target driven programme, training may be offered to specific members of the community. Such training could include developing an environmental ethic or improving overall technical skills.

In the second point advocacy is mentioned as a prior recommendation for changing the life style of poverty stricken communities along the coastal lines. Fishermen communities need strong civil society organizations for backing up their needs and representing them in front of governing bodies. These civil society organizations are more respected than the individual in the modern day Pakistani society.

## **8. References**

- “Promoting Sustainable Livelihoods For Coastal Fisherfolk - An Agenda For Advocacy”, Shirkat Gah, 2004
- Environment Legislation Book
- The Baluchistan Gazette, Govt. of Baluchistan, Law Department

**Annexure**

**Annex – I      Institution Analysis**

This table gives an overview of all important institutions involved in the policy making process and its implementation in Pakistan and are crucial for bringing about change for the betterment of fishermen communities.

Name of Institution	Role of Institution	Comment on Institution
<b>Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) – Balochistan</b>  Wood Cock Spany Nursery Samungli Rd, Quetta Contact: Dr. Abdul Jalil, D.G. Tel.: 081-9201840 Fax: 081-9201180 Email: pepa@qta.paknet.com.pk	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Advising &amp; coordinating with Government, Semi-Government Organizations, Industries, NGOs, &amp; various development agencies on preventive measures for abatement of pollution</li> <li>- Coordination Environmental Policies &amp; Plan</li> <li>- Implementing PEPA, 1997 &amp; NEQS</li> <li>- Rendering advise and assistance on environmental matters to various agencies</li> <li>- Establishment of monitoring system for effluents &amp; emissions</li> </ul> (Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) – Sindh</b>  Plot-St-2/1, Sector Korangi Industrial area, Karachi Contact: Mr. Shahid Lutfi, Deputy Director Tel.: 021-5065637, 5065620-1 Fax: 021-5065940	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Advising &amp; coordinating with Government, Semi-Government Organizations, Industries, NGOs, &amp; various development agencies on preventive measures for abatement of pollution</li> <li>- Coordination Environmental Policies &amp; Plan</li> <li>- Implementing PEPA, 1997 &amp; NEQS</li> <li>- Rendering advise and assistance on environmental matters to various agencies</li> <li>- Establishment of monitoring system for effluents &amp; emissions</li> </ul> (Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (PEPA)</b>  44-E, Office Tower, Blue Area, Islamabad Contact: Mr. Ahsan Rafi Kiani, Deputy Director Tel.: 051-9217882, 9205232 Fax: 051-9206343 Email: pakepa@isb.compul.cpm.pk	Administration and implementation of Pakistan Environment Protection Act, 1997 rule and regulation made under the act.  (Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Environment Section – Planning Comission Government of Pakistan</b>  Pak-Secretariat, Block-P, Room # 315, Islamabad Mr. Naseer Ahmed Gillani, Chief (Environment Section Planning Comission) Tel.: 051-9219396 Fax: 051-9210227, 9215787, 9202704	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Incorporation of environmental concerns in the national development policies, programmes and plans, as well as development projects conceptualization and approval stages</li> <li>- Review national development programmes and projects ....</li> </ul> (Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Forest, Wildlife &amp; Environment Department Government of Sindh</b>  Block No. 10, Sindh Secretariat #4-A, Karachi Contact: Mr. Shamsul haq Memon,	<u>Sindh Forest department:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Protect and Manage existing Revering Forests, Irrigated Plantations, Mangroves Forest and Rangelands</li> <li>- Increase tree cover on farmlands,</li> </ul>	

Name of Institution	Role of Institution	Comment on Institution
Secretary to Government of Sindh, FW & ED Tel.: 021-920105 Fax: 021-9203112 sfdp@cyber.net.pk	promote urban forestry and disseminate technology on nursery  <u>Sindh Wildlife Department:</u> ...  Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Ministry of Environment – Local Government &amp; Rural development</b>  2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor old Naval Head Quarter, Opp. Lal Masjid, CDA Block IV, Islamabad Contact: Mr. Ikram-ul-Bari, Technical Officer Tel.: 051-9208364 Fax: 051-9202211	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- National policy, plans and programmes regarding: a) Environmental Planning, Pollution and Ecology, b) Housing, Physical, Planning and Human Settlements including urban water supply, sewerage and drainage</li> <li>- Dealing and agreements with other countries and international organizations in the fields of Environment, housing, Physical Planning and Human Settlements</li> <li>- Pakistan Environmental Planning and Architectural Consultants Limited</li> <li>- Economic Planning and Policy making in respect of forestry and Wildlife</li> <li>- Administrative control: a) National Council of Conservation Wildlife in Pakistan Forest Institute, b) Zoological Survey of Pakistan</li> <li>- Administrative Control of the National Energy</li> <li>- Conservation Center (ENERCON)</li> <li>- Policy formulation: a) arranging international conventions, b) coordinating project, c) organizing mass awareness, d) Environmental legislation such as the Pakistan environmental Act, 1997</li> </ul> Source: Industrial Environmental Directory 2003)	
<b>Marine Fisheries Department</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Construction/establishment of a hatchery complex for shrimp and fin-fish, provides seed and extension services to the farmers desirous to take up mariculture in the coastal areas</li> <li>- Collects annual license and refundable security fee</li> <li>- Issues NOC for medium sized vessels in Zone –II</li> </ul> (Source: Deep Sea Fishing Policy)	
<b>Federal Marine Fisheries Department</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- management of coastal fisheries (Sikander Brohi)</li> </ul>	
<b>Sindh Fisheries Department</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- management of coastal fisheries (Sikander Brohi)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- must seek for assistance from other agencies in order to reduce pollution</li> <li>- the provincial fisheries department will have to reverse its almost entire attention to inland fisheries (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Sindh Coastal Development Authority</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- development of the coastal areas of only Thatta and Badin districts of Sindh with no jurisdiction in the coastal areas of Karachi (S.Brohi)</li> </ul>	



<b>Name of Institution</b>	<b>Role of Institution</b>	<b>Comment on Institution</b>
<b>Provincial Environmental Protection Authority</b>		- essential to be empowered to implement the federal Environmental Act (Shirkat Gah)
<b>(SEPA) Sindh Environment Protection Authority</b>		- present leadership believes it has no obligation for taking an active role in implementation (Shirkat Gah)
<b>Marine Pollution Board</b>		- do more about its mandate than ceremonial activities (shirkat Gah)
<b>National Fisheries Board</b>	- set up without any representation of fisherfolk (Shirkat Gah)	- failed to integrate fisherfolk into policy and law (Shirkat Gah)
<b>Maritime Security Agency</b>	- management of coastal fisheries (Sikander Brohi)	
<b>Sustainable Development Fund</b>	- annual contributions by fishermen (Shirkat Gah)	- use of contributions needs to be examined (Shirkat Gah)
<b>Coastal Development Fund</b>	- annual contributions by fishermen (Shirkat Gah)	- use of contributions needs to be examined (Shirkat Gah)
<b>Karachi Fish Harbour Authority</b>	- management of coastal fisheries (Sikander Brohi)	
<b>Karachi Fishermen Cooperative Society</b>	- promoting large commercial interests in and outside the community (Shirkat Gah) - management of coastal fisheries - supposed to represent fisherfolk communities (Sikander Brohi)	- encroachment of federal, provincial authorities over the representation of fisherfolk in this institution (Sikander Brohi)
<b>Fisheries Cooperative Society (FCS)</b>		- federal departments, autonomous bodies officials have been taken as the member of the Board of Directors of the FCS on the cost of representation of communities
<b>Korangi Fish Harbour Authority</b>	- management of coastal fisheries (Sikander Brohi)	
<b>Pakistan Network of Rivers, Dams and People</b>	- focusing upon adverse impacts on agriculture in general and the Indus delta in particular (Shirkat Gah)	
<b>Pakistan Fisherfolk Forum</b>	- launched 5 <sup>th</sup> May 1998 (Brohi) - PFF 'units' have been established in a number of FF villages of Karachi and Thatta coastal areas - Launch advocacy for the solution of the problem of the fisherfolk, to make the livelihoods of the fisherfolk sustainable and restore human rights of the fisherfolk and other communities (Brohi) - mobilizes communities and networks with other groups towards the goal of promoting fisherfolk livelihoods - several thousand members - campaign against industrial fishing - central importance of resource conservation emphasized in its annual celebration of the World Fisheries Day, through a festival and media (Shirkat Gah)	
<b>Pakistan Fisheries Board</b>		- representation of fisherfolk communities is negligible (Sikander Brohi)
<b>World Forum of Fisher Peoples</b>	- an organization through which local	

Name of Institution	Role of Institution	Comment on Institution
	fisherfolk can learn campaign tactics as well as gain international support for their campaigns (Shirkat Gah)	
<b>Shirkat Gah</b>	- lead in supporting advocacy for sustainable livelihoods of fisherfolk (Shirkat Gah)	- focuses on changing the Deep Sea Fishing Policy - is more an activist NGO
<b>PILER</b>	- involved in issues of coastal resource conservation (Shirkat Gah)	
<b>HRCF</b>	- involved in issues of coastal resource conservation (Shirkat Gah)	

Sources:

1) "Industrial Environmental Directory 2003", CPP (Cleaner Production Program), Principal House, Mezzanine Floor, Plot # 39 & 41C, 22<sup>nd</sup> Commercial Street Off. Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase-II Extension, Defence Housing authority (DHA), Karachi, Tel.: 021-5893341-42, Fax: 021-5893340, Email: [ccp@cyber.net.pk](mailto:ccp@cyber.net.pk), website: [www.ccp.org.pk](http://www.ccp.org.pk)

2) "Deep Sea Fishing Policy"

3) Shirkat Gah (Women's Resource Centre), "Pakistan – Promoting Sustainable Livelihoods for Coastal Fisherfolk, An Agenda for Advocacy", Oct. 2000

## Annex – II Policy-Impact Analysis

This table introduces the relevant policies effecting fishermen communities in Pakistan. It briefly summarizes the policy's content and comments on its impact.

Name of Policy	Policy/Law Summary	Comments on Impact
<b>Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997 (Act XXXIV of 1997)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Act defines environment very broadly to include water, all living organisms, ecosystem and ecological relationships and all interrelationships between components of the environment</li> <li>- Steps to combat overfishing in terms of ecologically sustainable catch are covered</li> <li>- Act can be applied to define and enforce licensing and catch limits, as well as closed seasons and area restrictions (these can be imposed by the federal or provincial government through delegation of federal authority)</li> <li>- Collective compensation claims can be filed by the fisherfolk through the Act</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Should reduce marine degradation</li> <li>- Provincial Environmental Protection Agencies should be asked to prepare studies for containing and reversing damage to marine resources, this can be best done in collaboration with the National Institute of Oceanography, University of Karachi, provincial Coastal Development Authority, environmental NGOs and GONGOs and local fisherfolk organizations</li> <li>- All public and private projects shall submit an environmental impact assessment to the federal environmental agency</li> <li>- Should enable adequate legal cover to combat pollution by foreign and joint-venture vessels, specially arising from large volumes of dead bycatch</li> <li>- a complete ban on deep sea fishing vessels can be imposed under this Act, it provides legal cover for a complete ban until comprehensive marine surveys indicate otherwise (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Balochistan Sea-Fisheries Ordinance, 1971</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- permission for fishing within three miles off the coast has been effectively banned to all except very small, local craft</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- has no provisions to deal with pollution, must be rectified immediately to cope with increasing urbanization,</li> </ul>

Name of Policy	Policy/Law Summary	Comments on Impact
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prohibition against destructive nets has been enforced to a large extend</li> <li>- To restrict access to Balochistan waters a recent amendment has set a fine of max. Rs. 100,000 (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<p>agriculture and proposed expansion of ports</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- marine resources have been better protected than in Sindh</li> <li>- commercial vessels from Singh frequently violate the restriction through collusion with Balochistan agencies</li> <li>- Balochistan should control overfishing in its waters through a comprehensive licensing system, corruption payoffs can then be transformed into legal premiums on resale of licenses issued to local fisherfolk (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>The Deep Sea Fishing Policy, 1995 (Amended in 2001)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Announced in 1995 by the Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (MINFA)</li> <li>- Fishing rights of Zone I (12-35 nautical miles) reserved for traditional fishermen</li> <li>- Zone II (35 to 200 n.m.) fishing by trawlers under license to be issued by MINFAL, 50 Long Liners (for tuna fishing) and 20 stern trawlers are allowed under the fishing license system for harvesting deep-sea yield level</li> <li>- Proposes to reduce the restricted area from 35 to 12 miles for deep sea vessels (S.G.)</li> <li>- Foreign trawlers are bound to off-load their catch in Pakistan</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What is needed: the extension of the restricted zone outwards and to deep sea vessels of all sizes, whether Pakistani or foreign (Shirkat Gah)</li> <li>- Discard is thrown in to the sea, creating environmental pollution in the coastal waters and genocide of the juvenile fish species</li> <li>- Violations of fishing boundaries by deep sea fishing trawlers</li> <li>- Trawlers off-load their catch in Dubai, Abu Dhabi and Oman</li> </ul>
<b>Territorial Waters and Maritime Zones Act, 1976</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government can take steps to prevent pollution in the deep sea (Shirkat Gah)</li> <li>- Cede complete fisheries jurisdiction over the contiguous zone, defined as 24 miles in the Act</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Should enable adequate legal cover to combat pollution by foreign and joint-venture vessels, specially arising from large volumes of dead bycatch</li> <li>- a complete ban on deep sea fishing vessels can be imposed under this Act (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Exclusive Fishery Zone Rules (Regulation of Fishing), 1990</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government can take steps to prevent pollution in the deep sea (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Should enable adequate legal cover to combat pollution by foreign and joint-venture vessels, specially arising from large volumes of dead bycatch (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Exclusive Fishery Zone Act, 1976</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Pakistan extended its jurisdiction up to 200 nautical miles in the sea from the coastline, this gave the country exclusive rights over the living resources of this extended jurisdiction (Brohi)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- a complete ban on deep sea fishing vessels can be imposed under this Act</li> </ul>
<b>The Indus Water Accord, 1991</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- valid right of provincial governments to decide the division of Indus waters (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government disposes community resources without prior consent or compensation (Shirkat Gah)</li> <li>- Sindh Government was supposed to conduct a study on how much freshwater is necessary downstream Kotri Barrage to maintain the ecosystem of the Indus Delta, so far no study has been conducted for more than 10 years (Sikander Brohi)</li> </ul>
<b>Coastal Development Authority Act</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- agency for the “development,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the authority could replace the</li> </ul>

Name of Policy	Policy/Law Summary	Comments on Impact
<b>of Sindh, 1994</b>	<p>improvement, and beautification” of the coastal areas of Thatta and Badin districts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- extending its mandate to conservation of marine resources in all of Sindh</li> <li>- the provincial Coastal Authority should conduct studies and action aimed at protection of marine fisheries (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<p>provincial Fisheries department as the primary regulatory agency for marine fisheries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- promote NGOs as partners in developing and implementing the agenda for equity and conservation (Shirkat Gah)</li> <li>- should make sure that the National Drainage Plan and Port Qasim expansion minimize adverse effects on fisheries and provide adequate compensation to fishermen for damage</li> <li>- should develop alternative employment opportunities for fisherfolk</li> <li>- promote fisherfolk participation as an integral part of law enforcement, support their mobility bei license fees and landing charges</li> <li>- money for compensation should consist of penalties and harbour landing charges (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Karachi Fisheries Harbour Authority Ordinance 1984</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- registration of fishermen and fish dealers</li> <li>- Harbour authorities must demand a valid federal and provincial fishing license (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Rules should be made to reinforce restrictions on fishing crafts and catch to sustainable levels made under the Fisheries Ordinance</li> <li>- License agreements are evaded by transferring catch to local vessels at sea, similar transshipment takes place in the distant sea; the betterment of the situation lies in regulations of catch limits (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Sindh Fisheries Ordinance, 1980</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- specific nets: Boola, Gujjo, Katra prohibited to protect breeding the catch of juveniles</li> <li>- shrimp trawling banned during the summer months (June, July)</li> <li>- Ban of catching the specific, such as Rohu, Mori, Thaila, Calbasu (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All marine pollution in territorial waters can be controlled through enforcement of the Ordinance</li> <li>- Necessary amendments to cover agricultural effluent</li> <li>- Rise on monetary penalties in order to have any impact on violations</li> <li>- Ordinance contains no provisions for damage compensation to fisherfolk</li> <li>- Regulations need to be enforced, incl. imposition of erious penalties</li> <li>- Seasonal ban should be applied to all commercial fishing craft without exceptions</li> <li>- Enforcing bans on catch and on seasons will require complementary restrictions on harbour landings and processing units (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>
<b>Provincial Fisheries Ordinance (general)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- regulation by leases, licenses and permits for all kinds of fish and shellfish, caught by any craft and type of net, in all public waters, including the territorial sea waters</li> <li>- breeding can be protected by banning catch of juveniles, including a restriction on using net types that would violate the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Amendments necessary to discourage the enormous levels of wasted catch (Shirkat Gah)</li> </ul>

Name of Policy	Policy/Law Summary	Comments on Impact
	ban; for the same purpose seasonal bans are imposed - Species can be declared “Protected” - Any public waters can be declared a sanctuary in which all fishing is prohibited except by special permit - Penalties, incl. seizure of catch, gear and craft can be imposed for violations (Shirkat Gah)	

Source:

- 1) “Pakistan: Promoting Sustainable Livelihoods for Coastal Fisherfolk; An agenda for Advocacy”, Shirkat Gah, Women’s Resource Centre, F-25/A-Block-9, Clifton, Karachi, Tel.: 021-570619/579211
- 2) “Sustainable Livelihoods of Fisherfolk in Sindh”, Study Report, by Sikander Brohi (Project Consultant), Comissioned by: Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) Islamabad

### Annex – III List of Stakeholder Meetings, Workshops and Seminars

- Dr. M.A. Kazi Institute of Chemistry, University of Sindh, Jamshoro: **2 Day Seminar on “Environmental, Social and Cultural Impact of Water Scarcity in Sindh”**, 16/01/04
- Abuzur Mariwala, **Vice Chairman of the Fisherman’s Cooperative Society Ltd. Marine Fisheries Department:** Comm. S. Q. Raza (Director General), S. M. Zafar Imam (Assistant Director), 12/02/2004
- Zubeida Birwani, **Shirkat Gah**, 13/02/04
- **Consultation Meeting on the Deep Sea Fishing Policy, 1995**, initiated by Shirkat Gah, 25/02/2004
- **EU Consultative Workshop**  
Tackling Poverty in Pakistan’s Coastal Communities: **Exploring the Poverty-Environment Relationship**, 26th February 2004
  - Experiencing how a workshop is set up and contributing with organizational work, e.g. Monitoring Participant’s/Coaster Lists
  - Working as a Documentation Specialist for the Workshop Report

### Annex – IV Fishermen Cooperative Society Data and Questionnaire

**FCS**

- Vice chairman: *Abuzur Mariwara*
- FCS supported by Sindh Livestock and Fisheries Minister: *Sardar Manzoor Ali Panhwar*
- management of coastal fisheries
- supposed to represent fisherfolk communities (see comments)
  
- **New policy:** Improve working conditions for fishermen at KHI Fish Harbour, protect interests of small-scale fishermen, raise foreign exchange earnings through export of fishery products (to Japan, USA, UK, Germany, Middle East etc.)
  - 1) provide better facilities
  - 2) improve infrastructure/extension services
  - 3) introduction of aquiculture techniques
  - 4) diversification of fishing efforts
  - 5) improvement in post-harvest techniques
  - 6) development of value added products
  - 7) enhancement of per capital consumption
  - 8) up-grade of socio-economic conditions of fishermen

- 9) Development of coastal towns
- 10) Create job opportunities
- 11) Establishment of schools and hospitals
- 12) Water/power supply
- 13) Reducing unnecessary existing costs, such as wastage of electricity

- Making Korangi Harbour fully operational
- Contact ADBP/SBFC for “soft loans” of small-scale fishermen

Sources: Dawn, Feb. 6<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup>, 2004

- **Next Aim:** Ban on usage of “fine fishing nets”

**Comments:**

- promoting large commercial interests in and outside the community (Shirkat Gah)
- encroachment of federal, provincial authorities over the representation of fisherfolk in this institution
- federal departments, autonomous bodies officials have been taken as the member of the Board of Directors of the FCS on the cost of representation of communities (Sikander Brohi)

**Q: FCS**

**General:**

- 1) Outline of the organizational structure of FCS: How many people are involved in the society and who? What tasks are given to them?
- 2) Kindly enlist the various stakeholders you are currently working with, or planning to work with, in order to improve the livelihood of fishermen?
- 3) Improvements of Korangi Harbour are certainly a priority. Who is funding the improvement work of Korangi Harbour? What is the outlook for the future? How will the improvement lead to higher productivity?

**Part I: Banning of Fishing Nets**

- 1) How are you planning to ban the usage of “fine fishing nets”? How will the implementation of the ban be monitored and when will this new policy be approved by the government?

**Part II: Forest and Fishery Relationship**

- 1) Without Coastal forest protection there can be no sustainable fishing, since it is essential to have a balanced ecological relationship between the fisheries and forest sector. Does a joint policy between the Fisheries and Forest Department exist?

**Part III: The New Policy**

- 4) What is the content of the “new” policy regarding fishermen released by the FCS? Is it possible to get a copy of the new policy?
- 5) What communities have been selected to work with?

**Part IV: Job opportunities**

- 1) What was the criteria for selecting 400 people for security/sanitation jobs at KHI Fish Harbour?
- 2) What other job opportunities exist in the future? What could be a possible strategy for creating new jobs?
- 3) Why did the naval personnel of KHI Fish Harbour leave?
- 4) What is the present interaction between Mr. M.A. Panhwar (Sindh Minister for Livestock and Fisheries) and FCS? How does FCS in general work with the Sindh Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries?
- 5) What efforts are made to provide jobs to poor fishermen?
- 6) What are the significant causes for underdevelopment costs? E.g. FCS has managed to successfully reduce electricity costs, by overcoming the under-development of this sector.

**Extra Q's:**

- 1) Who provides sponsorship for proposed initiatives of FCS? What other institutions besides ADBP and SBFC (←what is this)?
- 2) What priority projects do you have at the moment? E.g. infrastructure, introduction of aquiculture etc.
- 3) Can you give us examples of aquiculture in Pakistan?
- 4) How is the present cooperation of FCS and the provincial/federal government of Pakistan, and what can be done to improve it in the future?
- 5) What are the procedures for getting an approval of a policy?



- 6) What has been the experience in working with soft loans of ADBP and SBFC? Who has the responsibility of guiding these programmes?

## **Annex – V Minutes of the Meeting Fishermen Cooperative Society**

### **Minutes of Meeting With Abuzur Mariwala, Vice Chairman of the Fisherman's Cooperative Society Ltd.**

12/02/2004

- We were told that the FCS was founded in 1945 for the welfare of fishing communities, more specifically for their social development (education, health, etc).
- FCS has 15 board members, of which 7 are elected members, while the other 8 are government designated individuals. The 15 member board elects the Vice-Chairman (traditionally from the community) and the Chairman (traditionally a government employee) of the organization.
- For the first time in FCS's history, the Vice-Chairman is from another community than that of the Jamote family, seen as a revolutionary step by the FCS. The current Chairman Manzoor Panhwar, Sindh Fisheries Minister is cited as very supportive to the objectives of the FCS.
- Karachi Fish Harbour Authority was formed in 1984 as a government organisation who could receive EU grants for harbour development. It was established for a certain period only, but it still exists today.
- Mole holders are auctioneers who put the fisherman's catch for auction and in return receive a commission of 6.25% from the total value of the fish catch. Half of this amount goes directly to FCS for community initiatives, which is how FCS sustains its activities. Mole holders also provide loan to fishermen for boat purchase or repair, nets, fuel, ration during fishing voyage etc. hence the fishermen are bound to handover the catch to the particular mole holder from whom he has borrowed money.
- On a question, the VC said that the mole holder does not charge extrainterest on the loan other than the commission he gets from the auction of the catch.
- The Vice-Chairman claims that it faces limited resources and looks forward to developing big sustainable projects with funding from the provincial and federal government, instead of just focusing on piece-meal activities.
- A major reason for decreasing fish stocks was cited as the wire nets used by migrant populations, mostly Bengalis and Afghanis.
- The Wench (machine-net) system used on boats for fishing in the coastal creeks was cited as the most destructive practice because it results in catching of juvenile fish and shrimp species. The people who do it are solely in it for quick profit-making without any consideration to how much more everyone can benefit if the species were caught and sold when they reach post-juvenile stage.
- Foreign Deep Sea Fishing trawlers are also considered harmful, but less so than boats which use the wench system in the coastal creeks. But, FCS also wants complete ban on deep-sea fishing.
- Even though there has been a notification for banning of harmful nets, lack of implementation from Sindh Fisheries Department is not helping the cause. The Vice-Chairman claimed that the SFD cites lack of resources as the reason behind implementation failures.
- A new act is in the pipeline in which the FCS is proposing to ban Boolo and Gujjo nets, it has not been presented in the Sindh Assembly yet.
- The impact of cutting mangrove forests on the fisheries decline was denied by one senior board member, but the Vice-Chairman did acknowledge that cutting of forests was definitely a threat to the fisheries, however they did not inform us of any recommendation they had for protection of mangrove forests from over-harvesting. In fact, no initiatives to deal with external threats were mentioned.
- The new initiatives being proposed to the federal government include: a peeling complex (to decrease contamination, transportation costs), ice-factory, net mending shed, resting shed for fishermen, hospitals at Baba Bhit, Shams Pir, Khadar, Salihabad, a ferry shop, emergency boats, and a fish processing plant closer to where the fish are actually caught.
- The Vice-Chairman clearly cited Health, Education and Communication as the three biggest areas FCS was focusing on for the social development of the fishing communities.
- The Vice-Chairman was in favor of alternative livelihood avenues for the fishing communities. He believes that sons and daughters of fishermen should be able to choose whatever profession they choose instead of just sticking to fishing generation after generation.
- The Vice-Chairman invited WWF for field visits to various sites in Sindh and Balochistan.

## **Annex – VI Minutes of the Meeting Marine Fisheries Department and Shirkat Gah**

12<sup>th</sup> Feb. 2004

**Meeting with the MFD: Comm. S. Cl. Raza (Director General)**

- Coastal Creek Fishing as a serious issue leading to severe species loss
- Sharing of photographs from a field visit to a Balochistan fishing site

**Meeting with MFD: S. M. Zafar Imam (Assistant Director)**

- Influence of rangers and locals on the destruction of the natural habitat
- the small fishing vessels of local fishermen sweep the entire ocean floor with a 20.000t catch/per day in the shallow water, this catch consists mostly of juvenile fish
- the catch is bought by processing companies at the cost of 25-50 Rs/kg, and later on sold to poultry farms
- in Khi the same catch could be sold for 200 Rs/kg
- SFD is suppose to implement
- Lack of hygienic conditions
- Data of 1984-2003 reveals that the number of fish stock is decreasing

13<sup>th</sup> Feb. 04

**Meeting with Zubeida Birwani, Shirkat Gah**

- Colonial policies for the fisheries sector still exist in Pakistan
- Foreign trawlers enter the coastal waters, damaging NR
- Numerous foreign trawlers are only interested in tuna fish which occurs near the coast, the rest of the non-tuna catch is thrown into the water causing severe pollution and genocide on the juvenile fish
- FF (Fisherfolk) strike and media achieved that the passing out of licenses stopped for one hour and the govt. amended the Deep Sea Fishing Policy in 2001
- No implementation or monitoring of policies and laws exists, society suffers under corruption
- The Maritime Security Agency and the Navy support the DSFP
- Federal law clashes with provincial law
- Shirkat Gah has started an awareness programme in translating the DSFP into Urdu and is distributing it along the coast of Balochistan and Sindh (e.g. Balochistan: Kalamat Khor, Pasni, Somniani, Gwadar, Behra, Jiwani; Sindh: Ketu Bunder...)
- In Sindh there is generally more education than in Balochistan. The Balochi tribe system prevents institutions from accessing certain areas which makes it hard to implement policies and law
- Local communities are not aware of the existing three fishing zones defined in the DSFP, they are shocked when they realize that they had been kept in the dark for so long
- Field surveys are undertaken to collect relevant data for improvements of the existing policy. Such improvements are: demand for open waters, strict ban on all foreign trawlers and licenses
- No compensation or subsidies exist for fishermen according to Zubeida Birwani
- Zubeida points out Shirkat Gah's Workshop on the 25<sup>th</sup> of Feb. in Avari Towers for analysing the Deep Sea Fishing Policy with various institutions, government bodies and local fishermen communities. This meeting will be a historical event because it officially allows the fishermen to state their misconsent about the DSFP, giving fishermen and various stakeholder a chance to achireve some changes
- According to Ms Birwani, less fish is available in the EEZ which forces fishermen and foreign trawlers to enter the waters of Zone I
- Ms Birwani emphasizes that the use of "Wench" (machine nets) by local fishermen is not as harmful as the foreign trawlers
- In 1995 a Notification has been passed out against the use of fine nets
- During her field studies, Ms Birwani found out that local laws, enforced by the dshirga system are more useful in implementing existing policies
- A useful site to look at for further data concerning our topic is: [www.watergate.com](http://www.watergate.com)
- Another serious issue is that no sufficient drinking water is available for coastal communities