



# Recommendations for the 10th 5 Year Plan (2010-2015)



Indus for All Programme, WWF - Pakistan



## Introducing the Indus for All Programme

This paper has been developed by the Indus for All Programme, a programme currently being implemented (2007-2012) by WWF - Pakistan. As part of its interventions on the ground and translating these into a policy supportive format, the Programme has to develop a working paper on the Medium Term Development Framework 2005-2010 (MTDF), which is a 5 year macro-economic policy document produced by the Government of Pakistan that broadly indicates spending and investment in all sectors of the economy, including the environment. In 2009, the Government of Pakistan is preparing its 10th 5 - year plan (2010-2015), which is replacing the Medium Term Development Framework 2005-2010 document. This paper aims to provide recommendations to the consultation process for the finalization of the 10th 5 - year plan (2010-2015).

The Indus for All Programme has been designed in light of WWF-P's ecoregion conservation approach, experience of working with local communities, particularly the realization that lasting change on the ground can only result when local communities are engaged in natural resource management and advocating for a supportive policy environment. To achieve its objectives, the Indus for All Programme works with a number of partners at all levels to gain support for various interventions, policy changes and coordinates the activities of a diverse set of stakeholders. In its current phase, the Programme is operating at four priority sites in the Indus Ecoregion, representing critical ecosystems (coastal, freshwater, forest, and desert-wetland ecosystems) in Thatta, Sanghar and Shaheed Benazirabad districts. The Programme is particularly well suited to providing valuable recommendations for the environment sector discussed in the 10th 5-year development plan. The Programme has broken new ground in its important applied action research on poverty-environment linkages and its ecosystem valuation work. With regard to the grounded research on poverty-environment linkages, the Programme has tested these linkages at its priority sites, developed indicators to measure the strength of these linkages, and is engaged in the process of developing a manual – that would allow other users to develop, test and report on other suitable poverty-environment indicators.

In terms of its ecosystem valuation work, the Programme has conducted five economic valuation studies covering five representative ecosystems: coastal, freshwater, forest, rangeland and agriculture. These studies were prepared jointly with the School of Oriental and African Studies at the University of London. The total economic value (TEV) extends as well as corroborates existing estimates provided by the World Bank on whose basis the Government of Pakistan has cited an environmental degradation cost of Rupees 365 billion annually, which is the equivalent of US dollars 6 billion annually<sup>1</sup>. The WWF - P study is therefore an invaluable resource for planners and policy makers, who would want to decide whether to allocate land for development or instead invest resources in environmental conservation ensuring sustainable development.

<sup>1</sup> Martin, Paul Jonathan. "Pakistan: Strategic Country Environmental Assessment." *World Bank: South Asia*, 2007. World Bank. 9 Jan, 2009.

# Strengthening the 'Environment Approach'

The Medium Term Development Framework 2005-2010, which will be superseded by the forthcoming 10th 5-year plan (2010-2015), proposed an allocation of Rupees 28.3 billion for projects falling under the theme of environment and sustainable development. However, these last five years have only seen few projects emerge as a result of this allocation. One of the primary reasons for this failure in project development and implementation is the lack of capacity and resources, both technical and financial, at the federal, provincial and local levels. This problem has been compounded by poor communication between the different tiers of government and the absence of effective monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. However, once recognized, these factors can be addressed in the forthcoming 10th 5-year development plan in a holistic manner.

## Forests

One of the targets of the 10th 5-year plan and the Millennium Development Goals is to increase forest cover to equal 6% of Pakistan's land mass by 2015.

1. Mangrove forests are not only an excellent way of sheltering coastal communities from the threats of erratic weather patterns, climate change, but also provide a breeding ground for many fish and shell fish species, which generate revenue for the fishing industry and foreign exchange for the country.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5- year plan and the Ministry of Environment focus on increasing mangrove plantations along the coast and provide alternate source of fuel wood to the dependent communities.

2. In the course of the TEV studies, jointly prepared by WWF-P and the University of London, School of Oriental and African Studies, reliable estimates of volumes and values of carbon sequestered in an irrigated plantation and a coastal mangrove forest are provided. At the upcoming climate conference in Copenhagen there will be negotiations around the modalities of carbon markets and whether countries can encash carbon

Offsets emanating from forests, which is not an avenue that is available at present.

**Recommendation:** The Indus for All Programme recommends that the Planning Commission and the Ministry of Environment review the TEV studies and solicit input from experts at WWF – P to formulate their position on carbon markets for the climate talks at Copenhagen.

3. The Indus for All Programme has successfully explored the provision of solar, wind and hybrid (solar-wind combined) energy in its areas of intervention. Through a series of public and private partnerships with PCRET and HSBC the Programme has provided a variety of alternate energy units to its community partners. It has been observed that these alternate energy units, maintained by community members, not only reduce the pressure on fuel wood but also promote afforestation and sustainable use of forested areas.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5-year Plan and the Ministry of Environment explore the option of providing alternate energy to communities dependent on wood for fuel as a means of both protecting and promoting forest cover.

4. At present, it is extremely difficult to obtain good quality seeds for agro - forestry. By establishing nurseries to provide hardy seed stock and also creating outlets where these seeds would be publicly available at competitive market rates the Ministry of Environment will actively promote private agro-forestry thereby increasing land under forest cover, protecting habitat, and creating a sustainable source for harvesting timber for commercial use.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10<sup>th</sup> 5 year Plan and the Ministry of Environment explore the establishment of forest seed banks and introduce a seed certification system.

5. At present, forest land tends to be governed by a variety of departments ranging from the forest department to the revenue department. Competing claims on forested lands inhibit forest departments from taking full ownership of forest protection and maintenance, which in turn leads to deforestation and clearing of natural vegetation and forest lands for non-forest uses.

#### **Recommendation:**

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5-year Plan and the Ministry of Environment explore the option of consolidating all forested areas under the control of the respective provincial forest departments.

6. This should include a push towards harmonizing provincial forest laws and introduce international best practice standards for forest management. For instance, in Sindh, the Indus for All Programme is actively involved in revising the Forest Act, 1927 and the Wildlife Ordinance. The revisions are intended to promote modern and responsive forest laws.

#### **Recommendation:**

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5 year Plan and the Ministry of Environment should try to proactively harmonise and update forest related legislation across provinces; promote community based forest management; and explore the possibility of developing a best practices model for forest management.

## **Water use and combating desertification**

The objectives of increasing water efficiency and slowing the spread of decertification can be addressed through a number of means. The Indus for All Programme recommends the following:

1. Inefficient use of water for irrigation and over-extraction of water are two key reasons behind the spread of decertification. There are a number of ways the Government of Pakistan could approach this issue. These include:

#### **Recommendation:**

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5-year Plan explore the option of regulating the use of surface and sub-soil water by establishing and updating data on availability of ground and sub-soil water aquifers, licensing the use of sub-soil water, and developing and stringently implementing a ground water management policy.

2. Poor communication across different levels of government and delays in implementing projects have already been noted as some of the reasons behind the Government of Pakistan's poor performance in meeting its objectives and targets in the environment sector.

#### **Recommendation:**

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the National Committee to Combat Desertification should be activated and the Government should invite participation from both public and private sector groups that possess expertise and interest in addressing this issue.

#### **Recommendation:**

The Global Environmental Facility funded Sustainable Land Management Project was launched in 2007 and was to be located in the Planning and Development Departments at the provincial level. This is not the case. The project should be revitalized with appropriate resources being allocated for its resurrection in addition to bringing all relevant partners and stakeholders on board across all tiers of government.

## Market based instruments for promoting conservation

The 10th 5-year plan should consider market based instruments which would create incentives for both public and private organizations to participate in conservation.

1. A Payment for Environmental Services (PES) is said to exist whenever some external environmental service (ES) beneficiary makes a direct, contractual and conditional payment to local landholders or users in return for practices that ensure ecosystem conservation or restoration. The Indus for All Programme, is currently engaged in the process of developing a PES scheme as part of its Better Management Practices work at Chotiari Reservoir in Sanghar, for both cotton and sugarcane. By December, the Programme will deliver a PES feasibility and plan. WWF-P's Freshwater and Toxics Programme (FTP) has also worked extensively with buyers and sellers in the Punjab.

### Recommendation:

The Programme recommends that the Government of Pakistan should explore the possibility of piloting Payment for Environmental Schemes (PES) in the next five years. The Ministry of Environment, Finance Ministry and Board of Revenue should to visit WWF-P's PES sites and discuss the possibilities of scaling up this work between now and 2015.

2. At present the Government of Pakistan does not offer any market based incentives to promote conservation, in general, and the forests, in particular. Absence of these incentives makes it difficult to gain the interest and support of private sector organizations and private individuals, who are in a position to support the Government's work in this regard.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the Government of Pakistan should consider proposing incentives to support the protection and maintenance of forests. These incentives may include investing a set percentage of forest

revenues from timber and non-timber forest products back into forest departments at the provincial level.

## Improving rangeland conditions

The environment sector approach paper for the 10th 5-year Plan also discusses the objective of improving declining range land conditions.

1. Due to the arid climate and pre-existing low primary productivity of land, the carrying capacity of rangelands in Pakistan tends to be low. Therefore, any increase in the number of livestock units poses the risk of overgrazing and subsequent desertification. Carrying capacity is also affected by an increase in the number of livestock units raised in a particular area. At present, the livestock sector suffers from a serious lack of rangeland management, which may be attributed to limited human resources and management capacity, compounded by inadequate planning.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the 10th 5-year Plan, the Ministry of Environment, and the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (MINFAL) explore the possibility of maintaining and rehabilitating rangelands by collecting data, in terms of baselines, of the carrying capacity of rangelands in Pakistan. This data should be updated on a regular basis to make informed policy decisions and appropriate budgetary allocations.

2. Lack of capacity and training among agriculture and livestock staff, particularly extension staff, is another inhibits revenue generation from livestock and meeting the domestic demand for livestock products. Improving the quality of livestock animals in terms of health, mixing of breeds and types, in addition to appropriate veterinary services may play an important role in both increasing livestock yield and earnings.

## Building capacity and raising awareness

The objectives of improving the capacity of forest personnel, in particular, and government staff implementing environmental projects in general while raising awareness on environmental issues would also benefit from the following:

1. Poor capacity, in terms of training and familiarity with modern conservation techniques and ecological concepts, prevents Government personnel from appropriately and effectively implementing environmental projects. This problem is further compounded by inadequate budgetary allocations to ensure that staff training and capacity building needs are met across the different tiers of government, but particularly the provincial and local levels.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that the forthcoming 5 year plan increase budgetary allocations for appropriate and high quality trainings for both regular and extension staff.

### Recommendation:

The Programme also recommends that staff from the provincial forest departments should be trained in Geographical Information Systems (GIS). GIS offers a valuable opportunity for staff to not only understand how to map and assess forest cover, among other types of natural resources, but also develop data and image sets on environmental trends.

These are not only a valuable research tool but are also useful for making informed policy and strategy decisions at the national and sub-national levels.

2. Lack of coordination among government staff, poor communication, and inefficient reporting lines all contribute to ineffective management and serious delays in implementing interventions which in turn incur significant financial costs.

### Recommendation:

The Indus for All Programme recommends that reporting lines within government departments should be streamlined thereby made more effective, and harmonized at the national and sub-national levels. For instance, forest sector reforms might include the introduction of new forest management systems such as the creation of a national commission on forests to act as an oversight body. This mechanism has found success in Thailand, China and Indonesia to name a few countries.

### Recommendation:

Other possibilities for reform proposed by the Programme include the institutional reform of the Pakistan Forest Institute involving a revision of the curriculum, ensuring that a percentage of all forest officers acquire wildlife training, integrating training on natural resources management into forestry and engendering a deeper understanding of carbon offsets through forestry.

### For further information please contact:

Dr. Ghulam Akbar  
Regional Director,  
WWF - Pakistan

Khadija Zaheer  
Manager Policy and Programme Development,  
WWF - Pakistan

### Programme Management Unit (PMU)

606, 607 Fortune Centre, P.E.C.H.S  
Block-6, Main Shahra-e-Faisal, Karachi.  
Tel: 021-34544791-2, 34555173  
Fax: 021- 34544790

[www.foreverindus.org](http://www.foreverindus.org) [www.wwfpak.org](http://www.wwfpak.org)